

Resolution of Letter Ballot Comments

D96004r0 LB Comment Resolution on D96110rX3T13 Document Process:

Phoenix Yes Comments:

Comment: 1. Section 3.3 states some of the extensions and that there is a compressed format. I would also like to see a guideline for when documents should be compressed. For instance, the ballots were all compressed. These files are all small, ranging from 14k-27k. It would have been nice to eliminate the extra “unzipping” step and start with the end product.

Resolution: Accepted. The file size for small documents defined in D96119R1 64 KB will be added as the recommended break point for using compression.

Quantum NO comments:

Comment: We enthusiastically support the electronic distribution of as many documents as possible. However we disagree with the first sentence in Section 4.2 Communication document format: "All communications documents shall be distributed in electronic form..." We feel that this should be changed to: "All communications documents shall be distributed in electronic form, WHEN POSSIBLE,..."

Communication documents should be allowed to include elements that may not be currently available in a proscribed electronic format, e.g.: a schematic, engineering drawing, sketch or other material originating from some source other than the person submitting the communication document.

If the non-electronic elements of a communications document are to be later included in a project document then we feel that it should be the responsibility of the technical editor for the project to insure that the non-electronic element is properly converted to one of the proscribed formats at that time.

Resolution: Partially Accepted. The requirement for electronic form is two-fold. X3T13 has decided to have the primary mailing vehicle be electronic format. In addition certain documents may eventually be incorporated in a project document which is facilitated by having an electronic original. Shifting the responsibility of converting such documents from the contributing party to the technical editor is an unfair additional burden which the committee does not endorse. However it is recognized that certain contributions may be made to X3T13 which do not satisfy the intent of clause 4.2. Therefore a paragraph will be added to clause 2.1 which states:

“If documents are submitted to X3T13 which do not comply with the other provisions of this document process (e.g. a paper only document) the Chair will decide if the document will be accepted for a document number and if it will be included in a mailing by a scanning conversion to one of the standard formats.”

Gene Milligan YES comments:

Comment: Clause 4.1 ends with two periods.

Resolution: Accepted. We will move this period to one of the new sentences.

Comment: I think item (2) of Clause 5 should be "Name" rather than "Vice chair Name".

Resolution: Rejected.

Toshiba YES comments:

Comment: 1) Page 4, 5 Document submission

Original sentence.

3. Upload documents to the X3T13 FTP site.

See X3T13 FTP site usage document for upload procedure.

Change required.

Some companies are not capable of uploading documents to the ftp sites though they may be capable of downloading. This is a firewall issue and will not be resolved easily.

We need some kind of alternative method such as BBS or snail mail with FDD. Or we may add a comment "In case of problem with ftp uploading, submittor should contact Vice Chair".

Resolution: Accepted. Item (3) will be expanded to allow the alternative of submitting a "DOS formatted" diskette or Email UUENCODED copy of the file.

D96005r0 LB on D96111r0 X3T13 Project Document Format Guideline Results:

Gene Milligan YES comments:

Comment: I think Clause 5.1 should include headings without numbers (e.g Foreword).

Resolution: Rejected.

D96006r0 LB on D96119r0 X3T13 Electronic Notification and Distribution Procedure Results:

GSI NO comments:

Comment: The No was submitted on the basis of not having access to Email.

Resolution: Rejected. The added expense for Email, if any, is significantly less than the added cost of paper notification. Beyond the cost aspect the Email means offers productivity improvements for the administration of the committee.

Toshiba NO comments:

Comment a) 1. About the following sentence

>This document proposes a procedure for the task group X3T13, its ad hoc and affiliated activities regarding the notification of principal, alternate, and observer members of a meeting or teleconference.

1.1. What is the task group X3T13? Refer to D96108r0, TG is an organization established under a TC or SG to parent group such as X3T10.1. Currently X3T13 does not have a TG. Is this document intended to prepare for the time when TG was made under X3T13?

Resolution a): Accepted. Task group will be changed to Technical Committee.

Comment b) 1.2. What is Ad hocs and affiliated activity in more easy word?
Is this a meeting X3T13 holds between plenary meetings or is this a special meetings for TG or Ad Hoc groups or is this the plenary meetings of X3T13?

Resolution: Rejected. See the annex of D96108R0 for definition of the terminology.

This vote can be changed to Yes
if the substantive comments numbered 3, and 5 are resolved as indicated. All other comments are considered editorial in nature.
The changes indicated are mainly related to the concern of non X3T13 members willing to know about the information of the next meeting to find out if they should attend the meeting. The meeting announcement should be sent not only to X3T13 e-mail list but to X3T13 reflector also.

Recently I don't see the following sentence in the X3T13 minutes.

>2. Attendance and Membership

>

>Working group meetings are open to any person or company to attend and to
>express their opinion on the subjects being discussed.

As D96119r1 proposes a procedure not only for ad hocs but for affiliated activities, it is important to send information of the meeting in the way that any person or company willing to attend the meeting will be able to receive the information i.e. X3T13 reflector.

Comment 1. 1 st line:

"task group X3T13" should be "Technical Committee X3T13"

Resolution 1: Accepted.

Comment 2. Section 1: Means of notification

Second sentence:

The primary means of added to the X3T13 list -->

The primary means of added to the X3T13 e-mail list

Resolution 2: Accepted.

Comment 3. Section 2: Notification of meetings and tele-conferences

All members shall..... notice be sent at least three -->

All members shall..... notice be sent using the X3T13 e-mail list and the X3T13 reflector at least three

Resolution 3: Accepted. The statement will be changed to notice be sent using the X3T13 e-mail list and if a volunteer is currently providing a reflector, the X3T13 reflector at least three"

Comment 4. Section 5: Distribution of documents

The word documents is not clear. This should be stated as documents for meetings. (Should LB and tele-conference be added ?)

Resolution 4: Accepted. Clause 5 will be changed to "Distribution of documents for consideration at X3T13 meetings"

Comment 5. Section 5: Distribution of documents

1 st Sentence:

Small sent to the X3T13 e-mail list sent to the e-mail list, will

..... -->

Small sent to the X3T13 e-mail list and X3T13 reflector sent to the X3T13 e-mail list and X3T13 reflector, will

or

Small sent to the X3T13 reflector sent to the X3T13 reflector, will

.....

Resolution 5: Accepted. The statement will be changed to read "Documents to be sent using the X3T13 e-mail list and if a volunteer is currently providing a reflector, the X3T13 reflector"