

Accredited Standards Committee*
InterNational Committee for Information Technology Standards (INCITS)

Doc. No.: T13/09-116r0

Date: April 24, 2009

Reply to: Mark Overby

To: T13 Membership
From: Mark Overby
Subject: T13 Plenary Meeting (Longmont, CO) -- April 14 - 16, 2009

Agenda

1. Opening Remarks
2. Approval of Agenda
3. Attendance and Membership
4. Approval of the Previous Minutes
5. Review of Previous Action Items
6. Call for Patents
7. Old Business
8. New Business
9. Liaison Reports
10. Review of Action Items
11. Meeting Schedule
12. Adjournment

Results of Meeting

1. Opening Remarks

Dan Colegrove, the T13 Chair, called the meeting to order at 0905 Tuesday, April 14th, 2009. Dan Colegrove thanked Seagate for hosting.

As is customary, the people in attendance introduced themselves, and a copy of the attendance list was circulated.

The Chair briefly reviewed the meeting rules: T13 is a Technical Committee of INCITS and operates under INCITS rules. Anyone with interest in the work of the committee is free to attend and take part in discussions. However, motions and votes are limited to member organizations, one vote per member organization.

The Chair also noted that T13 operates under the INCITS antitrust guidelines. There should never be discussion of the following topics at any INCITS or an INCITS subgroup meeting:

- “Any company's prices or pricing policies;
- “Specific R&D, sales and marketing plans;
- “Any company's confidential product, product development or production strategies;
- “Whether certain suppliers or customers will be served;
- “Prices paid to input sources; or
- “Complaints about individual firms or other actions that might tend to hinder a competitor in any market.

Policies and Procedures and antitrust guidelines for INCITS are available at the web site at www.incits.org. T13 operates under these policies and procedures augmented by the T13 procedures at the T13 web site at www.t13.org.

*Operating under the procedures of The American National Standards Institute.
INCITS Secretariat, Information Technology Industry Council (ITI)
1250 Eye Street NW, Suite 200, Washington, DC 20005-3922
Email: incits@itic.org Telephone: 202-737-8888 FAX: 202-638-4922

2. Approval of Agenda

Mark Overby moved, Dan Colegrove seconded, that the agenda be approved as revised. The motion passed by unanimous consent.

3. Attendance and Membership

The Chair reviewed the rules for membership and attendance:

3.1 Membership

An individual from an organization new to T13 must attend at least one T13 plenary meeting before requesting voting membership. After that meeting, the representative may request membership from the T13 chair stating expertise and material interest in the scope of the committee and pay the required fees to INCITS. The time when membership becomes effective has just changed. Membership now becomes effective at the start of the next meeting the organization attends assuming the organization attends one of the next two meetings.

3.2 Fees

Current INCITS memberships fees are 1200.00 USD. Alternates are included in the membership fee.

Mailings of committee documents are available to any interested party after each plenary meeting. The cost for mailings for one year is 300.00 USD for mailing in the USA and 400.00 USD for mailing to a location outside of the USA.

Persons with questions or requests regarding membership fees and/or subscriptions for mailings should contact Barbara Bennett, ITI Standards Operations, at bbennett@itic.org.

3.3 Attendance

In addition to payment of fees, there are also minimum attendance and participation requirements to maintain voting membership status on T13. A representative from a member organization must attend two of every three plenary meetings and vote on at least every other letter ballot. If a member organization fails to have a representative in attendance at two of the last three T13 plenary meetings or vote on every other letter ballot, they are warned that failing to attend the next T13 meeting or to vote on the next letter ballot will result in their voting membership being terminated.

Attendance at a working group meeting does not affect voting membership status in T13.

The T13 voting membership during the meeting was 21 organizations.

The number of eligible voting members required for establishing a quorum was 7. 14 Member organizations were present at the start of the meeting, thus a quorum was present.

The following individuals attended:

Table 1: Attendance List

Attendee	Company		Attendee	Company
Mark Overby	NVIDIA		Dan Colegrove	Hitachi GST
Steven Wells	Intel		Bill Martin	Emulex
Sumit Puri	Fujitsu		John Goldman	Lexar Media
Patrick Hery	Toshiba		Frank Shu	Microsoft

Table 1: Attendance List

Attendee	Company		Attendee	Company
Fred Knight	NetApp		Stephen Finch	Western Digital
David Landsman	SanDisk		Jim Hatfield	Seagate
George Penokie	LSI		Hale Landis	STEC
Tom Pratt	Dell		Curtis Stevens	Western Digital

4. Approval of the minutes from the previous T13 plenary meeting (e09106r0)

Dan Colegrove moved, Mark Overby seconded, that the minutes be approved. The motion passed with unanimous consent.

5. Review of Previous Action Items

1. Curtis Stevens to change the website to comply with the notification of the public access model [carry over]
2. Dan Colegrove to issue letter ballot to reaffirm or withdraw TR-21-1999. [will handle at this meeting]
3. Dan Colegrove to talk to Gary Robinson about ISO and T13 standards. [done]
4. Dan Colegrove to issue letter ballot to forward ACS-2 amendment 1 to public review when draft is available. [done]
5. Dan Colegrove to issue letter ballot to forward APT to first public review when draft is available. [carryover]
6. Jim Hatfield to start process in liaison for SATA 3.0 material for ACS-2. [done]

6. Call for Patents

The Chair displayed the patent policy. A document is available from ANSI, "Procedures for the Development and Coordination of American National Standards", at no charge. This document is also on the INCITS web site at www.incits.org/help/ansi_sdo.html. Section 1.2.11 of that document contains the ANSI patent policy.

The Chair then called for patents and/or patent applications that may be necessary to comply with the requirements in T13 standards, draft standards, technical reports, or draft technical reports.

Dave Landsman (SanDisk) reported that they have intellectual property related to the sanitize proposal. Dan Colegrove pointed them to the patent policy and Dave stated that they intend to comply with the ANSI patent policy.

7. Old Business

7.1 Reaffirm / Withdraw 1226, INCITS/TR-21:1999, Enhanced BIOS Drive Technical Report

Curtis Stevens moved, Jim Hatfield seconded, that INCITS/TR-21:1999 be withdrawn. The motion passed with 15 ayes, 0 nays, and 0 abstentions.

7.2 ATA/ATAPI-7: 1532D

7.2.1 ISO Status

Dan Colegrove stated ISO is voting on parts 2 and 3 and editing is continuing on part 1.

7.3 HBA-2 Standard Project: 2014-D

Mark Overby stated that the project was pending the next draft of ATA8-AST for further work.

7.4 ATA/ATAPI-8 Projects

7.4.1 AT Attachment 8 - Command Set (ATA8-ACS)

7.4.1.1 ISO Status

T10 is processing the ISO paperwork for ATA8-ACS for a new work item. INCITS also reports that ATA8-ACS is still undergoing management review.

7.4.2 AT Attachment-8 - Parallel Transport (ATA8-APT)

7.4.2.1 Letter Ballot Requested Procedure

Mark Overby requested that people use e07166 as the commenting procedure document for the letter ballot. Mark also requested that people avoid using Acrobat Reader 9 (pro or standard is fine) when making comments due to bugs that have been identified in reincorporating the documents.

7.4.3 AT Attachment-8 - Serial Transport (ATA8-AST)

7.4.3.1 Review of Draft

John Geldman agreed to become the editor for ATA8-AST.

7.4.4 AT Attachment-8 - Architecture Model (ATA8-AAM)

7.4.4.1 ISO Status

Mark Overby and Curtis Stevens agreed to hold this until ACS begins process through ISO.

7.5 ACS-2 Project**2015-D [Stevens]**

7.5.1 ACS-2 Open Issues List (e07172)

[Stevens]

Curtis Stevens reviewed the open issues list and took feedback from the owners of open issues as to status and what the plan is for ACS-2 for those issues.

Curtis Stevens moved, Dan Colegrove seconding, that words 224 to 233 in ACS-2 be marked as reserved instead of Reserved for CE-ATA. The motion passed with 14 ayes, 0 nays, and 0 abstentions.

7.5.2 Device Statistics

7.5.2.1 Additional device statistics - Solid State (e06184) [Chen]

Joseph Chen was not present, so this item was deferred to the next meeting.

7.5.2.2 Long/Short Term Endurance (e09101) [Hatfield]

Jim Hatfield asked that this be deferred to the next meeting.

7.5.2.3 Candidate Sectors Statistics (e09104) [Livaccari]

Steve Livaccari was not present, so this item was deferred to the next meeting.

7.5.3 Security Command Update (e07104) [Chen]

Joseph Chen was not present, so this item was deferred to the next meeting.

7.5.4 Extended Security (e07189) [Chen]

Joseph Chen was not present, so this item was deferred to the next meeting.

7.5.5 Sanitize Command (e07197) [Geldman]

John Geldman reviewed revision 5 of the sanitize proposal. Feedback was given to John about the proposal and suggestions for revision.

7.5.6 Change Host Vendor Specific to Scratch Pad (e07159r0) [Stevens]

Curtis Stevens asked that this be removed from the agenda.

7.5.7 Reporting Non-Volatile Write Cache (e08116) [Livaccari]

Steve Livaccari was not present, so this item was deferred to the next meeting.

7.5.8 Extended Power Conditions (e08120) [Hatfield]

Jim Hatfield presented revision 8 of this proposal for discussion. Jim led a line by line review of his proposal and received feedback for a new revision. There was discussion about if the primary need for this was to match SCSI for uniformity or to help achieve maximum power savings. During this discussion a straw poll was held if a

standby_y state should be added. 4 people were in favor. A straw poll was also requested for how many people were opposed to adding a standby_y state. 1 person was in favor.

Jim updated the proposal and displayed revision 10 and received additional feedback for inclusion and discussion. Jim agreed to prepare a new revision for discussion during authorized teleconferences before the next plenary.

7.5.9 Protocol Identifier for TrustedFlash (e08126) [Landsman]
Dave Landsman asked that this be deferred to the next meeting. Jim displayed the revisions from the previous revision.

7.5.10 PUIS Update to Power Management state diagram (e08142) [Hatfield]
Jim Hatfield reviewed revision 2 of his proposal for updating the power management state diagrams for power-up in standby. Jim Hatfield moved, Curtis Stevens seconding, that e08142r2 as revised be incorporated into ACS-2. The motion passed with 13 ayes, 0 nays, and 1 abstentions.

7.5.11 DCO Clarifications (e08140) [Hatfield]
This agenda item was carried forward in error as the agenda item was approved at the last meeting.

7.5.12 Maximum LBA Range Supported Proposal (e08146) [Wells]
Steven Wells presented revision 5 of the proposal. Curtis Stevens moved, Fred Knight seconded, that e08146r5 as revised be incorporated into ACS-2. The motion passed with 14 ayes, 0 nays, and 1 abstention.

7.5.13 Synchronize with SATA 2.6 (e08143) [Hatfield]
Jim Hatfield moved, Curtis Stevens seconded, that e08143r2 as revised be incorporated into ACS-2. The motion passed with 13 ayes, 0 nays, and 1 abstention.

7.5.14 Obsolete TCQ (e08152r2) [Overby]
Mark Overby moved, Curtis Stevens seconded, that e08152r2 be incorporated into ACS-2. The motion passed with 11 ayes, 0 nays, and 1 abstention.

7.5.15 ASC/ASCQ Recommendations for ACS-2 [Overby]
The agenda item was deferred to the next meeting.

7.5.16 Alternate Unit Exception Methods (e09118r0) [Stevens]
Curtis Stevens presented an initial proposal to create an alternative method for reporting unit exception conditions. There was significant discussion over the merits of what is needed and if an alternate reporting mechanism was needed. There was discussion over what the intended use cases of the REQUEST SENSE behavior was and how this interacts with this. Curtis stated that he was interested in feedback for the next meeting.

7.5.17 Device Alert Log Pages (e08151r0) [Geldman]
This item was deferred to ACS-3.

7.5.18 Identify Data Log [Stevens]
This item was deferred to ACS-3.

7.5.19 ATAPI Removal [Stevens]
This item was deferred to ACS-3.

7.5.20 Set Features Revert to Defaults Behavior Setting After Hard Reset or POR(e08158) [Colegrove]
Dan Colegrove presented revision zero of a proposal to change the revert to defaults behavior feature. Dan Colegrove moved, Bill Martin seconded, that e08158r0 as revised be incorporated in ACS-2. The motion passed with 9 ayes, 0 nays, and 0 abstentions.

7.5.21 Obsolete SCT R/W Long (e08153) [Hatfield]

This item was approved at the previous meeting and was incorporated in the agenda in error.

7.5.22 Obsolete 28 Bit (e09105) [Overby]

Mark Overby presented revision 2 of the proposal to obsolete the 28-bit versions of commands. There was lengthy discussion over if the 28-bit commands could also be made optional at the same time. A straw poll was requested. 0 were in favor of mandatory, 11 were in favor of optional. Mark agreed to make the changes in the proposal for the next revision. Other feedback was given about the proposal and was incorporated during discussion.

7.5.23 Error in E.4.3 Alignments [Wolford]

Jeff Wolford was not present. Curtis Stevens displayed an e-mail that was sent previously about ACS that was deferred to ACS-2 for discussion regarding a potential error in Annex E. The problem was identified and Curtis agreed to correct the numbering as an editorial comment.

7.5.24 IEEE 1667 issue (e09115r0) [Geldman]

John Geldman presented a proposal to alter the way that the padding is specified for security protocols and to request a bit to identify 1667 as being present. Curtis Stevens noted that TCG creating a security protocol that violates the ATA security model is a bad idea. Jim Hatfield noted that he believed that was not the case.

John Geldman moved, Curtis Stevens seconded, that e09115r0 as revised be incorporated into ACS-2. Mark Overby moved to divide the question into 4.1.1 and the rest of the proposal. The motion to divide passed with 7 ayes, 2 nays, and 4 abstentions. On the divided question, the proposal for the identify bit (4.1.1) failed with 3 ayes, 4 nays, and 5 abstentions. The divided question for the remainder of the proposal passed with 13 ayes, 0 nays, and 0 abstentions.

7.5.25 Deprecated Keyword (e09119) [Overby]

Mark Overby presented a proposal to add a new keyword to ACS-2 to describe functionality that has been deprecated. There was discussion about how this would be used and Mark showed how he would use this as part of the process for removal of the 28-bit features. There was discussion that this could be moved into the 28-bit proposal as part of that proposal. Mark preferred to keep it on its own. A straw poll was held on if the text for deprecated was acceptable as presented to be used in another proposal. 11 were in favor, 1 was opposed.

7.5.26 Read Zero after Trim (e09117r0) [Knight]

Fred Knight presented a new proposal for ACS-2 to identify devices that read zero after a trim operation. Fred Knight moved, Mark Overby seconded, that e09117r0 be incorporated into ACS-2. Curtis Stevens requested that the 2 week rule be invoked and Dan agreed that the proposal had not met the 2 week rule and the proposal could not be approved at this meeting.

7.5.27 Draft Review [Stevens] [All Day Thursday]

Curtis Stevens led a review of the ACS-2 draft with an intended goal to resolve as many issues as possible in the anticipation of issuing a letter ballot following the next plenary. The members gave numerous items to Curtis for inclusion or change and Curtis agreed to revise the draft in advance of the next plenary.

7.6 EDD-4 (Project D2132)

7.6.1 Obsoleting item in EDD-4 (e09103) [Hatfield]

Jim Hatfield presented revision 1 of the proposal to obsolete items in EDD-4. No additional comments were received. Curtis Stevens moved, John Geldman seconded, e09103r1 be incorporated into EDD-4. The motion passed with 12 ayes, 0 nays, and 1 abstention.

7.6.2 Adding items to EDD-4 (e09102) [Hatfield]

Jim Hatfield presented revision 2 of a proposal to add items to EDD-4. Suggestions were made and Jim incorporated into the proposal. Jim Hatfield moved, Curtis Stevens seconded, that e09102r2 as modified be incorporated into EDD-4. The motion passed with 8 ayes, 0 nays, and 5 abstentions.

7.6.3 David F Comment on EDD-4 from Reflector [Hatfield]
The item was disposed of at the previous meeting and can be removed from the agenda.

7.6.4 Draft Review [Stevens]
Curtis Stevens reported no need to do draft review at this time.

7.7 Amendment for ATA8-ACS

Dan Colegrove reported that the letter ballot is still in process.

7.8 ACS-3 Study Group

7.8.1 Set Features Set Policy (e07121) (ACS-3) [Hatfield]
Jim Hatfield requested that the agenda item be deferred to the next meeting.

7.8.2 Freefall Feature Set Enhancements (e06162) (ACS-3) [Chen]
Joseph Chen was not present at the meeting, so this agenda item was deferred.

7.8.3 SCT Zone Control (e07169) (ACS-3) [Colegrove]
Due to a lack of time, this item was deferred to the next meeting.

7.8.4 ACS-3 Project Proposal [Stevens]
Dan Colegrove noted that the ACS-3 project proposal did not appear in the agenda two weeks in advance due to an error, so no final action could be taken and would be discussed at the next meeting.

7.9 T13 reflector, FTP, and web site setup

7.9.1 Annual Report to INCITS [Colegrove]
Dan Colegrove stated that the annual report for INCTIS was mainly the same as last year and that the annual meeting is next week.

7.9.2 INCITS requirement to transition to KAVI
Dan Colegrove reported no new information on the transition.

7.9.3 Reflector and Web Site
Curtis Stevens previewed the changes to the website to better download documents and the changes for complying to the public access policy for INCITS.

8. New Business

No agenda items were reported.

9. Liaison Reports

9.1 T10 [Colegrove]
9.1.1 SCSI to ATA Translation (SAT) Working Group [Overby]
Mark Overby reported that letter ballot comment resolution was continuing and SAT-3 was open for new proposals.

9.1.2 Power Management Issues [Hatfield]
This item was deferred due to a lack of time.

9.2 T11 [Martin]
This item was deferred due to a lack of time.

9.3 JEDEC
This item was deferred due to a lack of time.

9.4 IEEE

9.4.1 IEEE 1667 Authentication Standard for Transient Storage [Landsman]
This item was deferred due to a lack of time.

9.5 Trusted Computing Group

This item was deferred due to a lack of time.

[Hatfield]**9.6 SFF**

This item was deferred due to a lack of time.

[Colegrove]**9.7 IDEMA**

9.7.1 4K Physical

This item was deferred due to a lack of time.

[Colegrove]

9.7.2 HDD & SSD Reliability

This item was deferred due to a lack of time.

9.8 CFA

This item was deferred due to a lack of time.

[Geldman]**9.9 Serial ATA**

9.9.1 Copyright

Jim Hatfield presented a proposed copyright agreement between SATA-IO and T13 and asked for feedback.

[Hatfield]**[Hatfield]****9.10 SNIA**

9.10.1 SSSI

This item was deferred due to a lack of time.

[Colegrove]**10. Review of Action Items**

1. Curtis Stevens to change the website to comply with the notification of the public access model
2. Dan Colegrove to issue letter ballot to forward APT to first public review when draft is available.
3. All members to review proposed copyright agreement for ACS-2 with SATA-IO.

11. Meeting Schedules**11.1 Authorization of Ad-Hoc Working Groups**

Up to two teleconferences for discussion of ACS-2 proposals were authorized by motion (Mark Overby moved, John Geldman seconding, that up to two teleconferences for ACS-2 proposals be authorized. The motion passed with unanimous consent). The first conference as scheduled for May 13th, 2009 from 0900 to 1300 Pacific Time.

Curtis Stevens moved, Mark Overby seconding, that a teleconference be authorized for ACS-2 line by line review with the time and date to be announced on the reflector.

Curtis Stevens moved, Dan Colegrove seconding, that a working group session for ACS-2 line-by-line review be authorized until 5p MT. The motion passed with unanimous consent.

11.2 Next Meeting

Table 2: Next Meeting Information

Date	Location	Host	Contact
June 16 - 18, 2009	Milpitas, CA	Phoenix	Dale Jurich

12. Adjournment

Mark Overby moved, Dan Colegrove seconding, that the meeting be adjourned at 1409 PT, 16 April 2009. The motion passed with unanimous consent.