

Accredited Standards Committee*

InterNational Committee for Information Technology Standards (INCITS)

Doc. No.: T13/f10108r0

Date: March 4, 2010

Reply to: Mark Overby

To: T13 Membership
From: Bill Martin
Subject: T13 Plenary Meeting (San Jose, CA) -- February 23-25, 2010

Agenda

1. Opening Remarks
2. Approval of Agenda
3. Attendance and Membership
4. Approval of the Previous Minutes
5. Review of Previous Action Items
6. Call for Patents
7. Old Business
8. New Business
9. Liaison Reports
10. Review of Action Items
11. Meeting Schedule
12. Adjournment

Results of Meeting

1. Opening Remarks

Dan Colegrove, the T13 Chair, called the meeting to order at 0900 Tuesday, February 23, 2010. Dan Colegrove thanked Western Digital for hosting.

As is customary, the people in attendance introduced themselves, and a copy of the attendance list was circulated. Copies of the agenda were made available to those in attendance.

The Chair briefly reviewed the meeting rules: T13 is a Technical Committee of INCITS and operates under INCITS rules. Anyone with interest in the work of the committee is free to attend and take part in discussions. However, motions and votes are limited to member organizations, one vote per member organization.

The Chair displayed the INCITS patent policy and indicated that it would be available electronically on the T13 web site.

The Chair also noted that T13 operates under the INCITS antitrust guidelines. There should never be discussion of the following topics at any INCITS or an INCITS subgroup meeting:

- “Any company's prices or pricing policies;
- “Specific R&D, sales and marketing plans;
- “Any company's confidential product, product development or production strategies;
- “Whether certain suppliers or customers will be served;
- “Prices paid to input sources; or
- “Complaints about individual firms or other actions that might tend to hinder a competitor in any market.

*Operating under the procedures of The American National Standards Institute.

INCITS Secretariat, Information Technology Industry Council (ITI)

Email: incits@itic.org Telephone: 202-737-8888 FAX: 202-638-4922

The chair displayed the policies and procedures, patent guidelines, and antitrust guidelines for INCITS which are also available at the <http://www.incits.org/call.htm>, http://www.incits.org/pat_slides.pdf, http://www.incits.org/patdec_form.pdf, and <http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm>. T13 operates under these policies and procedures augmented by the T13 procedures at the T13 web site at www.t13.org.

2. Approval of Agenda

John Geldman moved, Jim Hatfield seconded, that the agenda be approved as revised. The motion passed by unanimous consent.

Jim Hatfield moved, Curtis Stevens seconded to ammend the agenda to include f10102 and f10103 for discussion under 7.7. The motion passed by unanimous consent.

3. Attendance and Membership

The Chair reviewed the rules for membership and attendance:

3.1 Membership

An individual from an organization new to T13 must attend at least one T13 plenary meeting before requesting voting membership. After that meeting, the representative may request membership from the T13 chair stating expertise and material interest in the scope of the committee and pay the required fees to INCITS. The time when membership becomes effective has just changed. Membership now becomes effective at the start of the next meeting the organization attends assuming the organization attends one of the next two meetings.

3.2 Fees

Current INCITS memberships fees are 1200.00 USD. Alternates are included in the membership fee.

Mailings of committee documents are available to any interested party after each plenary meeting. The cost for mailings for one year is 300.00 USD for mailing in the USA and 400.00 USD for mailing to a location outside of the USA.

Persons with questions or requests regarding membership fees and/or subscriptions for mailings should contact Barbara Bennett, ITI Standards Operations, at bbennett@itic.org.

3.3 Attendance

In addition to payment of fees, there are also minimum attendance and participation requirements to maintain voting membership status on T13. A representative from a member organization must attend two of every three plenary meetings and vote on at least every other letter ballot. If a member organization fails to have a representative in attendance at two of the last three T13 plenary meetings or vote on every other letter ballot, they are warned that failing to attend the next T13 meeting or to vote on the next letter ballot will result in their voting membership being terminated.

Attendance at a working group meeting does not affect voting membership status in T13.

The T13 voting membership during the meeting was 19 organizations.

The number of eligible voting members required for establishing a quorum was 7. 14 Member organizations were present at the start of the meeting, thus a quorum was present.

The following individuals attended:

Table 1: Attendance List

Attendee	Company		Attendee	Company
Alex Podgorsky	AMI		Bill Martin	Emulex
Tom Pratt	Dell		Kun Katsumata	Fujitsu
Dan Colegrove	Hitachi GST		Steve Livaccari	IBM
John Geldman	Lexar Media		George Penokie	LSI
John Schadegg	Marvell		Fred Knight	NetApp
Joseph Chen	Samsung		David Landsman	SanDisk
Jim Hatfield	Seagate		Patrick Hery	Toshiba
Jeff Wolford	HP		Curtis Stevens	Western Digital
Daniel Kim	Samsung		Bill Grace	SanDisk
Bob Griswold	Microsoft		Mark Overby	NVidia
Danny Ybarra	Western Digital			

4. Approval of the minutes from the previous T13 plenary meeting (e09159r0)

Jim Hatfield requested that 7.9.5 be modified to reflect that Jim Hatfield withdrew the motion, not the proposal. Dan Colegrove moved, John Geldman seconded, that the minutes be approved as modified. The motion passed with unanimous consent.

4.1 Error in June 2009 Minutes forwarding ACS Amendment 1

Dan Colgrove moved, Bill Martin seconded to ammend the minutes of the June 2009 plenary (e09126r0) to reflect in 7.6.1 that the motion was that e09123r1 be accepted as the letter ballot comment resolution for ATA/ATAPI-8 Command Set (ATA8-ACS) -Amendment 1 and that ATA/ATAPI-8 Command Set (ATA8-ACS) -Amendment 1 T13/Project 452 (contained in e08145r9 as modified from e08145r6) be forwarded to INCITS for first public review. The motion passed with 14 in favor, 0 against, 0 abstaining.

5. Review of Previous Action Items

1. Curtis Stevens to change the website to comply with the notification of the public access model. Curtis reported that he has hired a consultant who is working on the necessary changes.
2. Dan Colegrove to request INCITS withdraw TR-27. Completed

6. Call for Patents

The Chair deisplayed the patent policy earlier. A document is available from ANSI, "Procedures for the Development and Coordination of American National Standards", at no charge. This document is also on the INCITS web site at www.incits.org/help/ansi_sdo.html. Section 1.2.11 of that document contains the ANSI patent policy.

The Chair then called for patents and/or patent applications that may be necessary to comply with the requirements in T13 standards, draft standards, technical reports, or draft technical reports.

There was no response to the call for patents.

7. Old Business

7.1 Unassigned

7.1.1 T13 Reflector, FTP, and Website [Stevens]

Website is being updated to meet the INCISTS policies for access. Issues with the reflector are being addressed. There are issues with the WD spam filtering system.

7.1.2 Reflector item on successful command counting [Hatfield]

Jim brought in proposal f10102r0 to address this item. This proposal is covered in 7.7.6

7.2 ATA-7

7.2.1 Adopt ISO Version of ATA-7 to replace ANSI version [Colegrove]

All three volumes of ATA-7 have been approved by ISO. We have not received a copy of the ISO version. After we receive a copy of the ISO version we will determine if the ISO version should replace the ANSI version.

7.3 ATA8-AST

7.3.1 Review of Draft [Geldman]

John had questions from the work that he has done on revision 0. The group reviewed his questions and provided input. John will generate a new revision of the draft before the next meeting

7.4 ATA8-APT

7.4.1 Results of Letter Ballot Comment Resolution [Overby]

The current status is that Mark is about 90% done with integrating all letter ballot comments. The document will be posted prior to the next meeting for approval of the letter ballot incorporation.

7.5 ATA8-ACS

7.5.1 ISO Status Stevens

7.5.2 Amendment INCITS Status [Hatfield]

Dan Colegrove reported that this has been forwarded to the management review for final approval. There was a need to clarify the minutes for the June T13 plenary meeting about the actual document that was forwarded for first public review. The minutes were clarified in 4.1 of these minutes.

7.6 HBA-2

7.7 ACS-2

7.7.1 Sanitize Frozen State Transition Change [Geldman] 09134

John presented revision 0 of his proposal to address Editor's Note 2 in ACS-2. John Geldman moved, Dan Colegrove seconding, that e09134r0 as revised be incorporated into ACS-2 to resolve letter ballot comments against Editor's Note 2, Editor's Note 3, and letter ballot comments in the 4.22. The motion passed with 11 in favor, 0 opposed, and 2 abstentions.

7.7.2 Behavior of Write Uncorrectable in 4k devices [Hatfield] 09154

Jim presented revision 2 of his proposal to address ACS-2 letter ballot comments. Jim Hatfield moved, Curtis Stevens seconding, that e09154r2 as revised be incorporated into ACS-2 to resolve letter ballot comments relating to IDEMA concern about 4K sector handling. Curtis Stevens moved and George Penokie seconding to call the question, the motion passed 11 in favor, 2 opposed, and 1 abstention. The main motion passed with 13 in favor, 1 opposed, and 1 abstentions. Joseph Chen voted no because he wanted to clarify the error logging with the device statistics pending error count.

7.7.3 Letter Ballot Comment Resolution [Stevens]

We reviewed all open comments and resolved them. Curtis will incorporate all the comment resolution and generate a new revision of ACS-2.

7.7.4 Trim clarification [Knight] 09158

Fred presented revision 1 of his proposal to resolve ACS-2 comments related to Trim. Fred Knight moved, Curtis Stevens seconding, that e09158r1 as revised be incorporated into ACS-2 to resolve letter ballot comments relating to the Trim command. The motion passed with 12 in favor, 1 opposed, and 0 abstentions. George Penokie disagreed with the sentence in the proposal that began with "until".

7.7.5 2TiB Boundary Reporting [Stevens] 10106

Curtis presented his proposal which allowed for devices with greater than 2TiB of addressable space. Curtis Stevens moved, seconding Jeff Wolford, that f10106r0 as revised be incorporated into ACS-2. The motion passed with 13 in favor, 0 opposed, and 1 abstentions.

7.7.6 General Device Statistics Update [Hatfield] 10102

Jim presented revision 0 of this document to resolve a comment about a conflict with SPC-4. There was much discussion about the slight difference in how read and write command statistics are counted. Curtis Stevens moved, Dave Landsman seconding to carry discussion of f10102r0 to ACS-3. The motion passed 7 in favor, 4 opposed, 3 abstain. The general comment on the no votes was that ACS-3 should not change the current wording and implementation of these statistics.

7.7.7 Resolve APM EPC Conflict [Hatfield] 10103

Jim presented revision 0 of this proposal which addresses an email discussion of a conflict between APM and EPC timers. Jim Hatfield moved, Curtis Stevens seconding, that f10103r0 as revised be incorporated into ACS-2 to resolve email comments relating to the APV and EPC conflicts. The motion passed with 15 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

7.8 EDD-4**7.8.1 Draft Review [Stevens]**

We are waiting on incorporation of approved proposal. Curtis expects to have a new version completed within 2 weeks. When it is available, the chair will issue a letter ballot to close before the June meeting.

7.9 ACS-3**7.9.1 Device Alert Log Pages [Geldman] 08151**

John requested that this be carried over to the next meeting.

7.9.2 Identify Data Log [Stevens] 08156

Curtis presented revision 0 of this proposal. He had a number of issues that he requested input from the group on. Jim Hatfield moved and John Geldman seconded to approve e08151r0 as revised for inclusion in the next revision of SACS-3. After discussion Jim withdrew his motion. Curtis will take the input he received and will generate a new revision for the next meeting.

7.9.3 ATAPI Removal [Stevens] 08157

Curtis requested that this be carried over.

7.9.4 ASC/ASCQ Recommendations for ACS-3 [Overby]

Mark requested that this be carried over.

7.9.5 Report buffer size in IDENTIFY DEVICE [Hatfield] 09143

Jim is waiting for e08151 to be passed before approving this. This is a carry over.

7.9.6 Set Date and Time [Stevens] 09132

Curtis presented revision 1 of his proposal. Curtis Stevens moved and George Penokie seconded to accept e09143r1 as modified for inclusion in the next revision of ACS-3. The motion passed with 6 in favor, 2 opposed, and 3 abstain. Those opposed did not see a need for this and believe that it adds unnecessary complexity

7.9.7 Obsolete bit 6 of the Device field [Hatfield] 09155

Jim discussed revision 0 of his proposal. The group went through ACS-2 and generated additional letter ballot comments based on this proposal. Jim withdrew e09155r0 in favor of the comments added to ACS-2 letter ballot comment database.

7.9.8 Reporting Security Compliance [Hatfield] 09151

Jim asked to carry this over to the next meeting.

7.9.9 New download microcode subcommands [Hatfield] 09156

Jim presented revision 1 of his proposal. He received many comments and will bring a new revision to the next meeting.

8. New Business**8.1 8.1 Unassigned****8.1.1 Issues to be raised in INCITS Annual Report [Colegrove]**

The group had no issues for Dan to raise at the Annual meeting. Dan asked if anyone thought of issues to let him know in the next week.

8.1.2 INCITS Annual Meeting Hotel

Dan Colegrove indicated that INCITS would like T13 members to stay in the INCITS room block for the April meeting in Austin, TX. Dan will generate a meeting notice with the hotel information on it.

8.2 ATA-7

None

8.3 ATA8-AST

None

8.4 ATA8-APT

None

8.5 ATA8-ACS

None

8.6 HBA-2

None

8.7 ACS-2

None

8.8 EDD-4

None

8.9 ACS-3

None

9. Liaison Reports**9.1 T10 [Colegrove]**

SAT-2 is at INCITS for executive management approval.

9.2 T11 [Martin]

There was nothing to report at this meeting.

9.3 SATA-IO [Hatfield]

The SATA-IO board agreed to the copyright agreement. This is now waiting on INCITS approval.

9.4 JEDEC [Overby]

There was nothing to report at this meeting.

9.5 SNIA [Colegrove]

SSSI is continuing to work on Solid State statistics.

9.6 IEEE1667 [Landsman]

The transport annex for version 2 draft has taken another step and is approved for inclusion in the 2.0 draft.

9.7 Trusted Computing Group [Hatfield]

There is a new power modes subgroup. They are discussing power management interactions, especially with S3-Standby.

9.8 SFF [Colegrove]

Hitachi GST has proposed a new set of bottom holes for 3.5 in form factor. There will probably be new connector requirements coming from SAS 12 G. It would be the same geometry with different material specifications.

9.9 IDEMA [Colegrove]

Held 4K meeting on Monday of this week. There is nothing new for us to do for them at this time.

9.10 CFA [Geldman]

CF5 became available to members yesterday. They are about to start work on CF5.1 where they may change the CF feature set. CFA may define a use for a new ULTRA DMA set.

10. Review of Action Items

1. Curtis Stevens to change the website to comply with the notification of the public access model.
2. Chair to check with Gary Stephens about the availability of the ISO version of ATA-7.
3. SATA-IO Liaison to verify with SATA-IO that requiring Ultra DMA mode 6 (Identify Device Data word 88 bit 6) shall be set to one is not an issue. This has been a requirement since ATA-7.
4. Joseph Chen to bring issue of whether Identify Device Data words 100 .. 103 are valid if the NCQ feature set is supported and the 48-bit feature set is not supported to SATA-IO
5. Chair to issue a second letter ballot on forwarding ACS-2 for first public review.
6. Chair to review the membership count and the rollcall in the December 2009 minutes.
7. Chair to issue a letter ballot on forwarding EDD-4 for first public review.
8. IDEMA Liaison to request meeting room space for the April IDEMA meeting as part of the INCITS hotel arrangements.

11. Meeting Schedules**11.1 Authorization of Ad-Hoc Working Groups****11.2 Next Meeting**

Table 2: Next Meeting Information

Date	Location	Host	Contact
Apr 20-22, 2010	Austin, TX	Dell	Tom Pratt

12. Adjournment

Dan Colegrove moved, John Geldman seconding, that the meeting be adjourned at 12:20 PM, 25 February 2010. The motion passed with unanimous consent.